

CALGARY BOARD OF EDUCATION

Minutes of the Regular Meeting of the Board of Trustees (the “Board”) held in the Multipurpose Room, Education Centre, 1221 – 8 Street SW, Calgary, Alberta on Tuesday, February 12, 2019 at 12:00 noon

MEETING ATTENDANCE

Board of Trustees:

Trustee T. Hurdman, Chair
Trustee A. Adams
Trustee M. Bradshaw
Trustee L. Davis
Trustee M. Dennis
Trustee R. Hehr
Trustee J. Hrdlicka

Administration:

Mr. C. Usih, Chief Superintendent of Schools
Mr. D. Breton, Superintendent, Facilities and Environmental Services
Mr. B. Grundy, Superintendent, Finance/Technology Services and Acting Superintendent, Human Resources
Ms. S. Smith, Acting Superintendent, Learning
Ms. M. Martin-Esposito, Chief Communications Officer
Ms. K Fenney, Acting General Counsel and Corporate Secretary
Ms. T. Minor, Associate Corporate Secretary
Ms. M. Broda, Recording Secretary

Stakeholder Representatives:

Mr. T. Killam, Canadian Union of Public Employees, Local 40
Ms. J. Copithorne, Calgary Board of Education Staff Association
Mr. B. Cocking, Alberta Teachers' Association, Local 38
Ms. L. Nachtigal, Elementary School Principals' Association
Mr. M. Wilson, Senior High School Principals' Association

1 | **CALL TO ORDER, NATIONAL ANTHEM AND WELCOME**

Chair Hurdman called the meeting to order at 12:02 p.m. on the Link, and O Canada was led by the Dr. Gordon Higgins School Band students. A short recess was taken and the meeting reconvened in the Multipurpose Room at 12:10 p.m.

Chair Hurdman acknowledged the traditional territories and oral practices of the Blackfoot Nations, which includes the Siksika, the Piikani, and the Kainai. She also acknowledged the Tsuut'ina and Stoney Nakoda First Nations, the Métis Nation (Region 3), and all people who make their homes in the Treaty 7 region of Southern Alberta.



Chair Hurdman acknowledged and welcomed representatives from the aforementioned organizations and staff, students and parents in the public gallery.

2 | CONSIDERATION/APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Ms. T. Minor, Associate Corporate Secretary, noted that the proposed changes to the agenda include:

- Item 8.2 – Results Policies – Reasonable Interpretations be removed from the consent agenda for consideration at a future meeting;
- Item 8.3 – OE-3: Instructional Program – Annual Monitoring be removed from the consent agenda and considered as Item 5.1 to the agenda;
- Item 8.4.1 – Chief Superintendent’s Update be removed from the consent agenda for consideration immediately following the consent agenda; and
- Item 9.0 In-Camera Session be added to the agenda, and the remaining items be re-numbered accordingly.

MOVED by Trustee Adams:

THAT the agenda for the Regular Meeting of February 12, 2019, be approved as submitted, subject to the revisions noted above.

The motion was
CARRIED.

In favour: Trustee Adams
Trustee Bradshaw
Trustee Davis
Trustee Dennis
Trustee Hehr
Trustee Hurdman

Opposed: Trustee Hrdlicka

3 | AWARDS AND RECOGNITIONS

There were no awards or recognitions.

4 | RESULTS FOCUS

4.1 Dr. Gordon Higgins School Presentation

Dr. D. Yee, Area 4 Director, introduced the students and staff members from Dr. Gordon Higgins School. The school, located in the Northeast community of Rundle, serves students from Rundle, Temple, Redstone and Skyview Ranch. CBE Results 2: Academic Success expects each student to be literate and numerate, able to integrate the knowledge, skills, attitudes and competencies acquired across all academic disciplines. A video was shown highlighting the targets of their School Development Plan, with specific emphasis on increasing reading comprehension achievement goals.



Dr. Yee thanked the band students and their leader, Ms. Siemens, for their performance, and shared that they will be taking a trip to California soon to perform and attend workshops.

Ms. M. Hurst, Principal of Dr. Gordon Higgins School, spoke about the school serving 524 Grade 7 – Grade 9 students. The school has an academically and culturally diverse population. She noted the students would share how they are achieving success and mastering literacy and numeracy skills through their choice of experiential learning opportunities. The school approaches exploratory programming with academic rigor; the teachers design tasks that promote high levels of intellectual engagement and achievement. These courses allow students to develop ways of viewing work that help them achieve better results in their core courses as well as ways to explore and develop their passions for future careers.

Students, Samer, Jindjot, Jennifer, Hargun, Mohammed, Mohammed, Ayantu, Reem, Chloe, Ajla, Khowla, Izzy and Jordan shared their individual experiences and evidence of how they are able to integrate and apply the knowledge, skills, attitudes and competencies of literacy and numeracy in their various exploratory courses.

Principal Hurst thanked the Board of Trustees, Superintendent Usih and Dr. Yee for the opportunity to present on the learning and achievement at Dr. Gordon Higgins School. She invited everyone to Dr. Gordon Higgins' annual Heritage Fair on Thursday, April 4, 2019 at 6:00 p.m.

Trustee Dennis thanked the staff and students for their presentations and hard work.

4.2 Results 2: Academic Success – Annual Monitoring

Chair Hurdman noted that Administration presented the annual monitoring report for Results 2: Academic Success to the Board at the February 5, 2019 meeting where trustees posed questions and received clarification on various matters. The Board must now formally act on the monitoring report to determine whether reasonable progress has been made towards the ultimate achievement of this Results policy.

Administration responded to trustee questions on matters including: achievement results differences between genders in Mathematics and English Language Arts; clarification of math improvement for shape and space; and the differences between a cut score for the Provincial Achievement Test compared to the Diploma exam.

A trustee raised a point of order on Board Meeting Procedures with respect to allowing questions when the report and questions were already presented at a previous meeting. The Chair ruled that questions are allowed so that trustees feel they have all the information they need to make a decision.

A point of order was raised by a trustee on undermining the decision of the Board, to which the Chair ruled the comment made in debate was out of order.



MOVED by Trustee Adams:

THAT the Board of Trustees has reviewed the monitoring report on Results 2: Academic Success and concludes that reasonable progress is being made toward the ultimate achievement of this Results policy.

MOVED by Trustee Hrdlicka:

THAT the motion be amended by the addition of “with the exception of Indigenous students in all academic areas.”

In debate of the amendment, comments from trustees included: this group of students are the most marginalized and although it is important to look at all of our students, more focus is needed on this group.

Chair Hurdman called for the vote on the amendment.

The amendment was
CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

MOVED by Trustee Davis:

THAT the motion be amended by the addition of “and with the exception of student results in Mathematics.”

In debate of the amendment, comments from trustees included: the results show weakness in many areas of Mathematics; and results have remained static.

Chair Hurdman called for the vote on the amendment.

The amendment was
CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

Trustees debated the main motion as amended, with comments including: even though all areas are moving forward, there are still areas identified for improvement; Results 2 is the most important results area; ultimately we want every student to complete high school and that number is increasing; Administration is making important steps in the right direction; and every single student is an individual and they are important.

Chair Hurdman called for the vote on the main motion as amended.

The motion was
CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

MOVED by Trustee Davis:

THAT the Board of Trustees identifies a concern with the Grade 9 English Language Arts results.



Trustee comments in debate of the motion included: the results have remained at acceptable levels for a while, however its important to move the needle in this area; the Provincial Achievement Test is only one way to measure student results in ELA; scores are in the mid to high 90s; differences between report card results and Provincial Achievement Test results; and literacy is foundational for student success.

Recessed: 1:16 p.m.
Reconvened: 1:27 p.m.

MOVED by Trustee Hrdlicka:

THAT the motion be amended by substituting the words “concern with the Grade 9 English Language Arts results” with “concern in the areas of reading and writing in English Language Arts results.”

In debate of the amendment, comments from trustees included: the two lowest report card results shown in the December 2018 report to the Board are reading and writing; all English Language Arts aspects need to be considered, not just reading and writing; the grade 6 results are showing high in the Provincial Achievement Tests at over 90%; stems on the report card show that Mathematics achievement results is at the lowest levels, with reading and writing following those results.

Chair Hurdman called for the vote on the amendment.

The amendment was
CARRIED.

In favour: Trustee Dennis
Trustee Hehr
Trustee Hrdlicka
Trustee Hurdman

Opposed: Trustee Adams
Trustee Bradshaw
Trustee Davis

Trustees debated the main motion as amended, with comments including: literacy is very important; and, as we move forward, a view towards equity across the system may affect how the strategies are put forward.

Recessed: 1:47 p.m.
Reconvened: 1:51 p.m.

Administration responded to a point of information, noting that the only reading and writing data available for Grade 12 students are for those student that write a diploma exam. The report card data is not broken down to the specifics of reading and writing for students in Grades 10 to 12; therefore, the data sets would not be available.

Trustee Davis accepted a friendly amendment to the main motion, as amended, to read as follows:



THAT the Board of Trustees identifies a concern in the areas of reading and writing in English Language Arts results in Grades 1 to 9.

In debate of the main motion, as amended, comments from trustees included: the motion appears to direct the Chief Superintendent towards a strategy that essentially already exists, and this is not necessarily the work of the Board; we continually want to find improvement; the data obtained from Provincial Achievement Test results is important to pay attention to; the work that has been done is appreciated, and the work evolving over time is looked upon with anticipation; only 35% of Grade 9 students reported that they have the opportunity to understand their learning and explained why and how they are progressing is of concern; and how we are communicating achievement expectations and assessments for our students.

Chair Hurdman called for the vote on the main motion, as amended.

The motion was
CARRIED.

In favour:	Trustee Adams Trustee Davis Trustee Dennis Trustee Hehr Trustee Hrdlicka Trustee Hurdman
Opposed:	Trustee Bradshaw

MOVED by Trustee Hrdlicka:

THAT the Board of Trustees receives a quarterly update from the Chief Superintendent on the progress of the Indigenous Education Strategy.

MOVED by Trustee Davis:

THAT the motion be amended by substituting the words “a quarterly update” with “an update” and adding to the end of the motion “by November 30, 2019.”

In debate of the amendment, a trustee remarked on being cognizant of the amount of time it takes Administration to do the work and report back.

MOVED by Trustee Hrdlicka:

THAT the proposed amendment be amended by substituting the words “a quarterly update” with “semi-annual updates...”

In debate of the motion to amend the amendment, comments from trustees included: the success of Indigenous students has been an issue of concern for a number of years, as evidenced in the CBE's Three-Year Education Plans; trustees have an obligation to monitor the outcomes through the strategies for this group of students more than once a year; the strategy update reports are very valuable, as are the Results monitoring reports, but it is unknown if there will be further information provided in more frequent



updates on the Indigenous Education Strategy; it is concerning that this may take away resources from the strategies and learning in order to provide trustees with additional updates; it is important to show to our public that we are committed to this work; we need to look at this differently, to see what has worked and what has not worked for this group of students; and it is the Board's responsibility to accept all students and ensure they are successful.

Chair Hurdman called for the vote on the motion to amend the amendment.

The amendment was
DEFEATED.

In favour: Trustee Hehr
Trustee Hrdlicka

Opposed: Trustee Adams
Trustee Bradshaw
Trustee Davis
Trustee Dennis
Trustee Hurdman

In debate of the amendment, comments from trustees included: for the last six years the needle has not moved in terms of results for this group of students; it is important to find appropriate ways to ensure success for our Indigenous students; we don't monitor strategies, we monitor results; as a system we are not making reasonable progress with these students; not convinced more reports equals more action or insight into improving the results; need to focus resources in the schools for implementation of strategies; and trustees have the opportunity to allow the new Chief Superintendent to do his work for next 12 months with having a November 30, 2019 report date.

Chair Hurdman called for the vote on the amendment to the main motion.

The amendment was
CARRIED.

In favour: Trustee Adams
Trustee Bradshaw
Trustee Davis
Trustee Dennis
Trustee Hurdman

Opposed: Trustee Hehr
Trustee Hrdlicka

Recessed: 2:32 p.m.
Reconvened: 2:47 p.m.

For the purpose of clarification, the main motion as amended reads as follows:

THAT the Board of Trustees receives an update from the Chief Superintendent on the progress of the Indigenous Education Strategy by November 30, 2019.



Trustees debated the main motion with comments including: this is a step in the right direction; trustees need to look at this in the bigger picture of education, it is a concern that receiving more data more often may not actually assist in terms of clarity; these discussions at the Board table are important; and trustees' passion about public education is important and keeps trustees motivated to make change for the benefit of students.

Chair Hurdman called for the vote on the motion as amended.

The motion was
CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

MOVED by Trustee Dennis:

THAT the Board of Trustees directs the Chief Superintendent to provide additional information, including strategies, revised targets and the assessment of the strategies for each of the areas identified as an exception or a concern by November 30, 2019.

Chair Hurdman confirmed the Board of Trustees does not require a separate Indigenous Education Strategy report, and that the information may be included with this report.

Trustee comments in debate of the motion included: the Board has identified areas of concern and it is the duty of trustees to monitor student achievement results; and it will be valuable to receive a yearly report to see how areas of concern are progressing.

Chair Hurdman called for the vote on the motion.

The motion was
CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

At 3:06 p.m., Chair Hurdman received the consent of the Board to continue the meeting to the completion of the agenda.

MOVED by Trustee Bradshaw:

THAT the Board of Trustees commends the Chief Superintendent for continued outstanding student success in the subjects of Arts and Career and Technology Studies and Career and Technology Foundations.

Trustee comments in debate of the motion included: the results in these areas show students are actively involved and learn new skills they may not have learned elsewhere; this is the practical applications of what students have learned; these are the subjects that connect with students where sometimes core subjects don't; it is important to celebrate our students and diversity; there is a need for these programs and the opportunities to enhance students' life journey; the report cards indicate 90s and higher as success and it is questionable whether that is the baseline or is that worthy of commendation; some of the results were lower than last year; not sure the data supports a commendation motion; and it is questionable how many students are participating.



Chair Hurdman called for the vote on the motion.

The motion was
CARRIED.

In favour: Trustee Bradshaw
Trustee Dennis
Trustee Hehr
Trustee Hrdlicka

Opposed: Trustee Adams
Trustee Davis
Trustee Hurdman

MOVED by Trustee Dennis:

THAT the Board of Trustees commends the Chief Superintendent for continued outstanding student success at the Standard of Excellence in Biology 30, Physics 30, Chemistry 30 and Math 30-1 Diploma Exam results.

Trustee comments in debate of the motion included: year over year CBE student results in these subjects score higher than the provincial results; it is evident that students are achieving high levels of success in these subject areas; these results should be celebrated; CBE student participation rates are higher than the provincial participation rates; and these results show dedication of staff and the hardworking nature of our students.

Chair Hurdman called for the vote on the motion.

The motion was
CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

MOVED by Trustee Dennis:

- 1. THAT the Board of Trustees directs the Chief Superintendent to review the indicators for R-2: Academic Success, for Board reaffirmation or approval by June 30, 2019; and**
- 2. THAT the Board of Trustees directs the Chief Superintendent to review the targets for R-2: Academic Success, for Board approval by June 30, 2019.**

Trustee comments in debate of the motion included: the Board approved these motions last year, but it took some time to hire the new Chief Superintendent; and future discussions on this matter are anticipated.

Chair Hurdman called for the vote on the motion.

The motion was
CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.



5 | **OPERATIONAL EXPECTATIONS**

5.1 **OE-3: Instructional Program – Annual Monitoring**

Chair Hurdman noted that this report was introduced at the February 5, 2019 meeting where trustees posed questions and received clarification from Administration. She stated that the Board must now consider whether the Chief Superintendent is in compliance with the provisions of OE-3: Instructional Program. The purpose of considering this report is to satisfy the Board that its policy values are being complied with.

MOVED by Trustee Adams:

THAT the Board of Trustees approves that the Chief Superintendent is in compliance with the provisions of OE-3: Instructional Program.

MOVED by Trustee Hrdlicka:

THAT the motion be amended to include “with the exception of policy subsection 3.4.”

In debate of the amendment, comments from trustees included: a question of how Administration can be expected to meet subsection statement 3.4, indicator 3.4.3 when the funding framework is not keeping up with costs; and this policy subsection is hard to fulfill as we want transportation to provide more than what is legislated and this is difficult to do when funding is frozen or cut.

Chair Hurdman called for the vote on the amendment.

The amendment was
CARRIED.

In favour: Trustee Adams
Trustee Bradshaw
Trustee Dennis
Trustee Hrdlicka
Trustee Hurdman

Opposed: Trustee Davis
Trustee Hehr

The main motion, as amended, did not receive debate by trustees. Chair Hurdman called for the vote on the main motion as amended.

The motion was
CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

MOVED by Trustee Davis:



THAT the Chief Superintendent review reasonable interpretations and indicators for OE-3: Instructional Program for Board reaffirmation or approval by June 30, 2019.

Recessed: 3:40 p.m.
Reconvened: 3:43 p.m.

Following the recess, Trustee Davis accepted a friendly amendment to change the date to December 10, 2019. The main motion as amended reads as follows:

THAT the Chief Superintendent review reasonable interpretations and indicators for OE-3: Instructional Program for Board reaffirmation or approval by December 10, 2019.

In debate of the motion, comments from trustees included: the belief there is a disconnect between the interpretations and what is actually being measured; the current monitoring measures actions as opposed to outcomes; this is an opportunity to have better indicators; an examination of R-2 indicators is anticipated in the Board's work plan and some of these seem to tie in, so good timing to look at these policies together; the Board keeps taking on work and not realizing that this is adding work on Administration and staff who are stretched thin; hesitation to take on another very big initiative; it is the Board's work to regularly evaluate; it is the Chief Superintendent's duty to tell the Board when the workload is being pushed too hard; uncertainty how the Board expects to have time to get this work done on top of all the other work expectations.

Chair Hurdman called for the vote on the motion, as amended.

The motion was
CARRIED.

In favour: Trustee Adams
Trustee Bradshaw
Trustee Davis
Trustee Dennis
Trustee Hehr
Trustee Hurdman

Opposed: Trustee Hrdlicka

6 | **PUBLIC COMMENT**

There were no public comments.

7 | **MATTERS RESERVED FOR BOARD ACTION**

There were no items.

8 | **CONSENT AGENDA**



The Chair noted that items on the consent agenda are approved with the agenda as follows:

8.1 Approval of Minutes

- Regular Meeting held November 27, 2018
- Regular Meeting held December 4, 2018
- Regular Meeting held December 11, 2018

THAT the Board of Trustees approves the minutes of the Regular Meetings held November 27, December 4 and 11, 2018, as submitted.

8.4 Items Provided for Board Information

8.4.2 Construction Projects Status Report

The following item was removed from the consent agenda:

8.4.1 Chief Superintendent's Update

Administration responded to trustee questions on matters including: clarification of Reboot: everyone can code: computational thinking comments in the report; Teacher Training Commons; Diversity Learning Support Advisors' team; the classification of a translator and an interpreter; and the Technology Evergreen Program – smart board's versus large television monitors (installation of interactive displays).

Chair Hurdman noted that the Board would meet in-camera following the public portion of the meeting to discuss four land matters. She noted the next public Board meeting is scheduled for Tuesday, March 5, 2019.

Recessed: 4:01 p.m.

Reconvened: 4:12 p.m.

9 | **IN-CAMERA SESSION**

Motion to Move In-Camera

MOVED by Trustee Dennis:

Whereas the Board of Trustees is of the opinion that it is in the public interest that matters on the private agenda for the Regular Meeting of the Board of Trustees, February 12, 2019, be considered at an in-camera session; therefore, be it

Resolved, **THAT the Regular Meeting of the Board of Trustees moves in-camera.**

The motion was
CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.



Motion to Revert to Public Meeting

MOVED by Trustee Hehr:

THAT the Regular Meeting of the Board of Trustees moves out of in-camera.

The motion was
CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

10 | **ADJOURNMENT**

Chair Hurdman declared the meeting adjourned at 4:58 p.m.

